# Alameda Corridor Transportation Authority On-call Engineering

## **List of Proposers**

**ABS Consulting Inc.** 

**KPFF Consulting Engineers** 

Moffatt & Nichol, Inc.

Zephyr Rail

### **Scoring of Proposers**

| Proposal Team          | Score |
|------------------------|-------|
| А                      | 46    |
| В                      | 69    |
| С                      | 70    |
| Moffatt & Nichol, Inc. | 79    |

#### Alameda Corridor Transportation Authority

# Project: On-call Engineering SUMMARIZED SELECTION EVALUATION FORM FOR ALL RESPONSIVE PROPOSERS

#### SCORING GUIDELINES:

Rater's Score: (Range 0-5) - 0=not included/non responsive; 1=Marginal Abilities, Serious Deficiencies; 2=Adequate with Minor Deficiencies; 3=Adequate, Standard-Acceptable; 4=Well Qualified; 5=Exceptionally Well Qualified.

Weighting Factor: the weighting factor provides a means of assigning importance to each criterion (1 low through 6 high).

Weighted Score = for each criterion, the Rater's Score is multiplied by the Weighting Factor to obtain the Weighted Score.

<u>Total Score</u> = sum of all Weighted Scores. **Maximum points possible = 100.** 

Evaluated by:

(All Evaluators Combined) 3/14/2024

| SCORES FOR PROPOSING FIRMS              |                            |         |         |         |          |         |                              |         |         |          |         |         |                 |         |          |                        |         |         |         |          |                          |         |         |         |          |                     |         |
|---|----------------------------|---------|---------|---------|----------|---------|------------------------------|---------|---------|----------|---------|---------|-----------------|---------|----------|------------------------|---------|---------|---------|----------|--------------------------|---------|---------|---------|----------|---------------------|---------|
| CRITERIA TO BE RATED (Weighting Factor) | A. Firm Qualifications (4) |         |         |         |          |         | B. Project Org & Mgmt<br>(6) |         |         |          |         | C. S    | Staff Qualifica | ations  |          | D. Fee Schedule<br>(3) |         |         |         |          | E. Responsiveness<br>(2) |         |         |         |          | Average<br>Weighted | Ranking |
|   | Rater 1                    | Rater 2 | Rater 3 | Rater 4 | Combined | Rater 1 | Rater 2                      | Rater 3 | Rater 4 | Combined | Rater 1 | Rater 2 | Rater 3         | Rater 4 | Combined | Rater 1                | Rater 2 | Rater 3 | Rater 4 | Combined | Rater 1                  | Rater 2 | Rater 3 | Rater 4 | Combined | - 1                 |         |
| Team A                                  | 1                          | 2       | 2.5     | 2       | 7.5      | 1       | 3                            | 4       | 2       | 10       | 1       | 2       | 2.5             | 2       | 7.5      | 3                      | 5       | 4       | 0       | 12       | 3                        | 4       | 4       | 0       | 11       | 46                  | 4       |
| Team B                                  | 4                          | 3       | 3       | 2       | 12       | 4       | 3                            | 5       | 3       | 15       | 3       | 4       | 3.5             | 4       | 14.5     | 4                      | 4       | 3       | 2       | 13       | 3                        | 2       | 4       | 4       | 13       | 69                  | 3       |
| Team C                                  | 3                          | 4       | 4       | 3       | 14       | 4       | 4                            | 3.5     | 3       | 14.5     | 3       | 4       | 4               | 3       | 14       | 2                      | 4       | 3       | 3       | 12       | 4                        | 5       | 4       | 2       | 15       | 70                  | 2       |
| Moffatt & Nichol, Inc.                  | 4                          | 5       | 4.5     | 4       | 17.5     | 4       | 4                            | 4       | 4       | 16       | 3       | 5       | 4               | 4       | 16       | 4                      | 4       | 3.5     | 2       | 13.5     | 3                        | 5       | 4       | 3       | 15       | 79                  | 1       |